

AN ANALYSIS OF THE THIRD YEAR STUDENTS' DIFFICULTIES IN TRANSFORMING QUOTED SPEECH TO REPORTED SPEECH AT ENGLISH DEPARTMENT IN BUNG HATTA UNIVERSITY

Belinda Yunita¹, Lely Refnita¹, Lisa Tavriyanti¹

¹Jurusan Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris, Fakultas Keguruan dan Ilmu Pendidikan Universitas Bung Hatta

E-mail : Belinda 68@ymail.com

Abstract

Based on the writer's experience while taking Advanced Structure subject, there were some students who got trouble to apply sequence of tense in reported speech. So that, the writer was interested in doing a research about students' difficulties in transforming quoted speech to reported speech. The goal of this research was to describe students' difficulties in transforming quoted speech to reported speech at the English Department of Bung Hatta University. The research design was descriptive. There were 23 third year students as a sample. Grammatical Transformation Test was as an instrument in this research. Based on data analysis, it can be known that transforming time was the most difficult type for the students in 4 tenses (Simple Present Tense, Present Continuous Tense, Simple Past Tense, Simple Future Tense). It was supported by the data that there was 75% of students getting difficulties in Simple Present Tense, 85% in Present Continuous Tense, 70% in Simple Past Tense, 75% in Simple Future Tense. In Present Perfect Tense, there was 51% of the students having difficulties in tense changing. Based on the result above, it could be concluded that the students still had difficulties in transforming quoted speech to reported speech. Since the students faced difficulties in time changing, the writer suggests them to memorize the change of time in reported speech. And since the students also faced difficulties in tense changing, the writer suggests them to keep practicing their grammar and to understand the rule of tense changing.

Key words : Students' difficulties, Grammar, Reported Speech

Introduction

How can we use English well without mastering its grammar? Grammar helps us to comprehend what we listen. Grammar is also useful in making good sentences when we are speaking. Next, grammar also has role in reading to make us understand what we read. Finally, grammar also helps us to express our idea in writing. All of these

mean that grammar is important in the four language skills.

There are many topics when we study Grammar. One of the topics studied in grammar is quoted speech and reported speech. When the students want to tell the story or review someone's arguments or opinion to other people, quoted speech and

reported speech are very important to be mastered by the students.

Based on the writer's experience, there were some students' difficulties, such as:

Quoted speech:

Dick asked, "what are you talking about?"

Student's Reported Speech:

Dick asked me what were I talking about.

Expected answers:

Dick asked me what I was talking about.

Based on the phenomenon above, the writer was interested in doing the research of the third year student's difficulties at English Departement of Bung Hatta University in transforming quoted speech to reported speech.

Azar (1993:366) states that reported speech is to reproduce the idea of another person's word, not all of the exact words are used. Verb forms and pronoun may change and quotation marks are not used.

There are some changing in reported speech, such as time expression change, tenses change, pronoun change and possessive change. They will be more discussed below :

Time Expression Change

According to Broukal and Wisniewska (2005:331), time expression can also change in reported speech. Here are some common changes.

The table of time expression changes in reported speech

Quoted	Reported
Now	Then
Today	that day
Tonight	that night
Yesterday	the day before
Tomorrow	the next day
this week / month/year	the week / month/year
last week/ month/year	the week/ month/year before
next week/ month/year	the week/ month/year after
two weeks/ months/years ago	two weeks/ months/years before

For examples :

Quoted speech:

She said, "I'm going on vacation **today**."

Reported speech:

She said that she was going on vacation **that day**.

Tenses Change

According to Manurung (2011:211), in reported speech the verb used as predicate must be changed as follow:

The table of tense change in reported speech

Quoted Speech	Reported Spech
Present Tense	Past Tense
Present Cont.Tense	Past Continuous T
Future Tense	Past Future Tense
Present Perfect T	Past Perfect Tense
Present Perfect.Cont.T	Past Perfect.Cont.T
Past Perfect Tense	Past Perfect Tense

For example:

Quoted Speech:

She said, "I **go** to market."

Reported Speech:

She said that I **went** to market.

Pronouns change

Here are some common examples according to Broukal and Wisniewska (2005:329):

The table of subject pronouns change in reported speech

Quoted	Reported
I	he, she
You (singular)	I he, she
We	They
You (plural)	We They

For example:

Quoted:

Sam said, "I'm leaving."

Reported:

Sam said that **he** was leaving.(Sam was leaving)

The table of object pronouns change in reported speech

Quoted	Reported
Me	Him, Her
You (singular)	Me Him, her

Us	Us Them
You (plural)	Us them

For example:

Quoted:

Sam said, "It's for **me**."

Reported:

Sam said that it was for **him**. (It was for Sam).

Possesive change

Here are some common examples of possessive change according to Broukal and Wisniewska (2005:330):

Table of possessive change in reported speech

Quoted	Reported
My	His, her
Your (singular)	My His, her
Our	Their
Your (plural)	Our their

For example:

Quoted:

Sam said, " **My** son is sleepy."

Reported:

Sam said that **his** son was sleepy.

(The Son is the speaker's)

Research Method

The study was conducted by using descriptive method. Particularly, this study was designed to describe and analyze the students' difficulties in transforming quoted speech to reported speech.

The population of this research was the third year students of English Department of FKIP Bung Hatta University in academic year 2012/2013. The total number of population was 112 students. They were distributed in 3 classes, class A, B, and C. The writer chose them because they had learnt Advanced Structure. The writer used the cluster random sampling technique to chose sample.

The steps of using this technique were as follow: the writer prepared one piece of paper and then divided it into 3 pieces. They were A for first piece, B for second piece, and C for third piece. The writer rolled each pieces of the paper and mixed them. Finally the writer selected one paper randomly. The choosen paper represented

the sample. And class B was as a sample of research.

To collect the data, the writer used grammatical transformation form as suggested by Brown (2004:226). It was useful to know the students' difficulties in transforming quoted speech to reported speech. The students answered 30 questions and the test took 60 minutes. There were six questions for each tense. They were two questions in positive, two questions in negative, and two questions in interrogative.

Before giving the real test on June 18, 2013, the writer did the try out test first on June 13, 2013. The purpose was to know whether the students could understand the instruction of test or not, whether the time to do test was enough or not, and to identify the validity and reliability of the test.

The writer used content validity. The writer designed the test item with advisors. And the test was suitable with student's lesson in Advanced Structure subject.

To find out the reliability of grammar test, the writer used split half method by using Pearson Product Moment formula. And the result was analyzed by using Spearman Brown formula.

After the writer counted the reliability, the writer found that r counted was .96.

Then to know whether the test was significance or not, the writer compared r counted .96 with r table .4438 It can be said that r counted was higher than r table. It means that the test was significant and it could also be used as instrument to gather the data.

The techniques that the writer used in gathering the data were as follows:

1. Administering the test to the students.
2. Collecting the result of the test.
3. Checking the students' answer.

In analyzing the data, the writer used the procedures as follows:

1. The writer prepared a frequency table
2. The writer clasified the students' difficulties in terms of tenses and elements stated in Table below:

Table of guide for clasifying student's difficulties

No.	Elements	Frequency
1.	Incorrect in pronoun changing	1
2.	Incorrect in tenses changing	1
3.	Incorrect in time changing	1

Then the writer calculated the percentage of difficulties of each element in the following five tenses. The writer used formula :

$$P = \frac{F}{N} \times 100 \%$$

Where :

P = Percentage

F = Total incorrect sentence

N = Total sentences

Finally, to answer the research questions, the data were grouped into the following categories :

1. Students' difficulties in transforming quoted speech to reported speech in Simple Present Tense
2. Students' difficulties in transforming quoted speech to reported speech in Present Continuous Tense
3. Students' difficulties in transforming quoted speech to reported speech in Simple Past Tense
4. Students' difficulties in transforming quoted speech to reported speech in Present Perfect Tense
5. Students' difficulties in transforming quoted speech to

reported speech in Simple FutureTense

Results and Discussions

This part presents the data which were got through grammatical transformation test. The grammatical transformation test also dealt with changing pronoun, tenses and time. The data were in five forms of transformation; transforming from Simple Present Tense to Simple Past Tense, Present Continuous Tense to Past Continuous Tense, Simple Past Tense to Past Perfect Tense, Present Perfect Tense to Past Perfect Tense, and Simple Future Tense to Past Future Tense.

Results

Students' Difficulties in Transforming Quoted Speech to Reported Speech in Simple Present Tense

Based on the data analysis, it was found that students' difficulties in transforming quoted speech to reported speech in Simple Present Tense were pronoun changing, tense changing, and time changing. From the table, it can be seen that in *Simple Present Tense*, 16% of the students got difficulties in pronoun changing, 56% of the students got difficulties in tense changing, and 75% of the students got difficulties in time changing. It indicated that time changing was the most difficult type of transforming

for the students. It is shown in Table below:

The Table of Students' Difficulties in Transforming Quoted Speech to Reported Speech in Simple Present Tense

Elements	Incorrect Answer	N	Percentage
Pronoun Changing	22	138	16 %
Tenses Changing	77	138	56 %
Time Changing	103	138	75 %

Students' Difficulties in Transforming Quoted Speech to Reported Speech in Present Continuous Tense

From the result of data analysis, it was found that students' difficulties in transforming quoted speech to reported speech in Simple Present Tense were pronoun changing, tense changing, and time changing. In transforming quoted speech to reported speech in *Present Continuous Tense*, there was 61 % of the students having difficulties in transforming pronoun, there was 51% of the students having difficulties in tenses changing, and then there was 85% of the students having difficulties in transforming time. It was the same with the previous tense that time

changing was the most difficult one for the students.

The Table of Students' Difficulties in Transforming Quoted Speech to Reported Speech in Present Continuous Tense

Elements	Incorrect Answer	N	Percentage
Pronoun Changing	84	138	61 %
Tenses Changing	71	138	51 %
Time Changing	117	138	85 %

Students' Difficulties in Transforming Quoted Speech to Reported Speech in Simple Past Tense

Students' difficulties in transforming quoted speech to reported speech in Simple Past Tense were pronoun changing, tense changing, and time changing. From the table, it also can be said that in transforming quoted speech to reported speech in *Simple Past Tense*, the percentage of students' difficulties was 19% in pronoun changing, 59% in tenses changing, and 70% in time changing. The percentage showed that time changing was not an easy type in transforming quoted speech to reported speech.

The Table of Students' Difficulties in Transforming Quoted Speech to Reported Speech in Simple Past Tense

Elements	Incorrect Answer	N	Percentage
Pronoun Changing	26	138	19 %
Tenses Changing	81	138	59 %
Time Changing	97	138	70 %

Students' Difficulties in Transforming Quoted Speech to Reported Speech in Present Perfect Tense

The students also had difficulties in transforming quoted speech to reported speech in Present Perfect Tense. It is supported by the fact that there were students getting difficulties in pronoun changing, tense changing, and time changing. The percentages of difficulties were 23%, 51%, 29%. It means that tense changing was the most difficult one for the students.

The Table of Students' Difficulties in Transforming Quoted Speech to Reported Speech in Present Perfect Tense

Elements	Incorrect Answer	N	Percentage
Pronoun Changing	32	138	23 %

Tenses Changing	70	138	51 %
Time Changing	39	138	29 %

Students' Difficulties in Transforming Quoted Speech to Reported Speech in Simple Future Tense

In this transforming, the students were required to transform Simple Future Tense to Past Future Tense. Students' difficulties were in pronoun changing, tense changing, and time changing. The data demonstrated that 36 % of the students got difficulties in pronoun changing, 61 % of the students got difficulties in tense changing, 75% of the students got difficulties in transforming the time. It means the most difficult one is transforming the time.

The Table of Students' Difficulties in Transforming Quoted Speech to Reported Speech in Simple Future Tense

Elements	Incorrect Answer	N	Percentage
Pronoun Changing	49	138	36 %
Tenses Changing	84	138	61 %
Time Changing	104	138	75 %

Discussions

Students' Difficulties in Transforming Quoted Speech to Reported Speech in Simple Present Tense

From the result of the data analysis, time changing was the most difficult one for the students, the second difficulties was tense changing, and the last difficulties was pronoun changing. The students' difficulties might be caused by they did not know about time changing in transforming quoted speech to reported speech. The follow are the examples of students' difficulties:

1. Item 3: Sally said, “**I** don't go to the market **today**.”

Students' answer :

Sally said that **I** didn't go to the market **that time**.

2. Item 1 : Clara said, “**I need** to talk to you this week.”

Students' answer:

Clara said that she **needs** to talk to me this week.

From example 1, the students had difficulties in pronoun changing and time changing. *I* in quoted speech is expected to transform into *she*, because of *Sally*. And *today* is expected to transform into *that day*. But the

students used *that time*. From example 2, it showed that the students had difficulties in tense changing. The students still used Simple Present Tense in reported speech. It must be changed *Simple Present Tense* to *Simple Past Tense*. *Need* must transform into *needed*.

Students' Difficulties in Transforming Quoted Speech to Reported Speech in Present Continuous Tense

The students also got difficulties in transforming quoted speech to reported speech in Present Continuous Tense. Time changing was not an easy type for the students. It might be caused by they did not have more information about time changing in reported speech. It was followed by pronoun changing and tense changing. These are the examples of students' difficulties:

1. Item 7: Mery said, “**We** are studying **now**.”

Students' answer:

Mery said that **ours** are studying **now**.

2. Item 8: Jim said, “**We are playing** in the park **today**.”

Students' answer:

Jim said that were **we** playing in the park **today**.

Based on the example 1, the students also had difficulties in pronoun changing. *We* became *ours*. In example 2, *we* did not change. The expected answer is *we* must be changed to *they*. Sometimes in reported speech *we* can not change (inclusive *we*) but in this research, the students were expected to change the pronoun (exclusive *we*). For example:

Quoted speech: *Sam said, "We are singing."*(inclusive *we*)

Reported speech: *Sam said that we were singing.*

It means that Sam and other people were singing.

Quoted speech: *Sam said, "We are singing."*(exclusive *we*)

Reported speech : *Sam said that they were singing.*

It means that *they* includes other people but not Sam.

In tenses changing, the rule of transforming is from Present Continuous Tense to Past Continuous Tense. From example 2, the answer can be true if the arrangement was correct. In time changing, the students must change *today* into *that day*.

Students' Difficulties in Transforming Quoted Speech to Reported Speech in Simple Past Tense

From the data analysis, students' difficulties in Simple Past Tense was the

same with students' difficulties in Simple Present Tense and Present Continuous Tense. Time changing was the most difficult one for the students. It was supported by the data 70 % of the students had difficulties in time changing. The second difficulties was tense changing and the last difficulties was pronoun changing. Students' difficulties might be caused by they did not memorize about time changing that has given by the lecturers. See the examples below:

1. Item 16: Suneo said, "**I** did not come to the meeting last week."

Students' answer:

Suneo said **we** had not come to the meeting the week before.

2. Item 13: John said, "I **did** my homework **last night**."

Students' answer:

John said that he **have done** his homework **thenight after**.

In example 1, *I* refer to *Suneo*. The pronoun must be changed into *he*. And example 2, *Simple Past Tense* usually transforms into *Past Perfect Tense* but the students transformed it into *Present Perfect Tense*. In time changing, *last night* is expected to transform into the *night before*, but the students changed it into *the night before*.

Students' Difficulties in Transforming Quoted Speech to Reported Speech in Present Perfect Tense

Different from the others tenses, in transforming quoted speech to reported speech in Present Perfect Tense, the most difficult one was tense changing. It was supported by the data that 51% of the students had difficulties in tense changing but pronoun changing and time changing were less difficult. Students' difficulties might be caused by they did not really understand about Past Perfect Tense. These are the examples of students' difficulties:

1. Item 22: Clara said, "I have not met you for two years."

Students' answer:

Clara said that had met you for two years.

2. Item 19: Bondan said, "I **have sent** the letter **since last month**."

Students' answer: Bondan said that he **have been sent** the letter **since last month before**.

Based on example 1, the students omitted the pronoun of the sentence. In example 2, the students wrote *have been sent* in tense changing. The correct changing is *had sent*. The writer found that the students' difficulties in changing time

only in small percentage. But it means that the students still had difficulties. From example 2, *since last month* must be changed to *since the month before*.

Students' Difficulties in Transforming Quoted Speech to Reported Speech in Simple Future Tense

Finally, the students also had difficulties in transforming quoted speech to reported speech in Simple Future Tense. The most difficult type was time changing, it might be caused by they just had a little information about time changing in reported speech. The second difficulties was tense changing, and the last difficulties was pronoun changing.

For example:

Item 27: Aqilla said, "I **will not do** the same mistake **tomorrow**."

Student's answer:

I would not done the same mistake **other time**.

From the example, the students got difficulties in pronoun changing, tense changing and time changing. *I* must be changed to *she*. Next, the tense must become Past Future Tense, *I will not do* must become *I would not do*. Then, *tomorrow* must become the *next day*.

Conclusions

Based on the findings, in general it can be concluded that the students' difficulties in transforming quoted speech to reported speech were pronoun changing, tense changing, and time changing. These are the detail of the results:

1. In transforming Simple Present Tense to Simple Past Tense, the students had difficulties in time changing, tense changing, and pronoun changing. Time changing was the most difficult one for the students. It was indicated by the majority of the students (75%) who had difficulties in time changing. It might be caused by they did not know about time changing in reported speech.
2. In transforming Present Continuous Tense to Past Continuous Tense, the students also had difficulties to transform pronoun, tense, and time. The students faced many difficulties in time changing. It was indicated by the majority of the students (85%) who faced difficulties in time changing. It might be caused by they did not have more informations about time changing.
3. In transforming Simple Past Tense to Past Perfect Tense, students'

difficulties were pronoun changing, tenses changing, and time changing. Many students faced difficulties in time changing. It was supported by the data, 70 % of the students had difficulties in time changing. It might be caused by they did not memorize time changing that has given by the lecturer.

4. Like the other tenses, the students also had difficulties in transforming Simple Future Tense to Past Future Tense in tense, time and pronoun changing. Time changing was the most difficult type for the students to transform. There was 75% of the students had difficulties in time changing. It might be caused by they just had a little information about time changing in reported speech.
5. In transforming Present Perfect Tense to Past Perfect Tense, it was different from the other tenses, the students faced many difficulties in tense changing and just some mistakes in pronoun and time changing. It was supported by the data, 51% of the students faced difficulties in tense changing. It might be caused by they did not really understand about Past Perfect Tense.

Suggestions

Related to the findings, there are several suggestions proposed in this research.

1. Since many students faced difficulties in transforming quoted speech to reported speech in time changing in 4 tenses (Simple Present Tense, Present Continuous Tense, Simple Past Tense, Simple Future Tense) the writer suggests the lecturers to give the students more informations about time changing and for the students to memorize the change of time in transforming quoted speech to reported speech.
2. And since the students also faced difficulties in tense changing in transforming Present Perfect Tense, the writer suggest the lecturers to give the students more exercises and for the students to keep practicing their grammar and to understand the rule of tense changing.
3. For further researchers, this research has already discussed about students' difficulties in transforming quoted speech to reported speech. It is better for the next researchers to find the cause of students' difficulties.

Finally the writer also says thank you so much for her both advisors; Mrs. Dr. Lely Refnita, M.Pd and Mrs. Dra. Lisa Tavriyanti, M.Pd. who guided her sincerely and patiently in finishing her thesis. The writer's sincere gratitude also goes to the Dean and Vice Dean of Teacher Training and Education Faculty; Dr. Marsis, M.Pd and Drs. Khairudin, M.Si. and also the chairwoman, the secretary, the lecturers, and all staff in English Department of Bung Hatta University for their support during her study. The writer's big thank also goes to the junior students (Bp 10) who helped her in gathering the data.

This thesis is truly dedicated to her beloved parents, Ibu Sri Yuliati and Ayah Bakri, her sweet sister and brother for their endless love. This thesis is also presented for her beloved aunt and uncle, Ibu Syamsidar and Bapak Syawalman, who support and care for her until the writer could struggle in her studying. And thank you to the ones that their names cannot be listed one by one in this thesis. Finally the writer hopes this thesis would be useful to the readers.

References

- Arikunto, Suharsimi. 2009. *Dasar-Dasar Evaluasi Pendidikan*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Azar, Betty Schramper. 1993. *Fundamentals of English Grammar(2rd Ed)*. Jakarta : Binarupa Aksara.
- Broukal, Milada and Wisniewska, Ingrid. 2005. *Grammar Form and Function 3*. New York: Mc Graw Hill.
- Brown, Douglas H. 2004. *Language Assesment Principles and Classroom Practices*. New York: Pearson Education Inc.
- Gay,L.R. 1987.*Educational Research: Competencies for Analysis and Application*.Ohio: Merrill.
- Manurung, Heldin. 2011. *Learner's English Grammar*. Bogor : Great Media

